EXHIBIT N



In The Matter Of:

Tammy Kitzmiller, et al. v. Dover Area School District, et al.

> William Buckingham January 3, 2005

Filius & McLucas Reporting Service, Inc. 1427 East Market Street, York, PA 4309 Linglestown Road, Harrisburg, PA

(717) 845-6418 or (717) 236-0623

Original File WB010305.TXT, 141 Pages Min-U-Script® File ID: 2722092160

Word Index included with this Min-U-Script®

Tammy Kitzmiller, et

William Buckingham January 3, 2005 C Case 4:04-cv-02688-JEJ Document 86-16 Filed 09/19/05 Page 4:04-cv-02688-JEJ Page 4:04-cv

	Page 20		Page 2
[1]	please.	[1]	A: Yes.
[2]	(The court reporter read back the previous	[2]	Q: Do you read a paper daily?
	question.)	[3]	A: No.
[4]	A: Ancestor to what?	[4]	Q: Do you read any paper on a regular basis?
[5]	BY MR. HARVEY:	[5]	A: No.
[6]	Q: To all life forms including man.	[6]	Q: Do you get any papers delivered to your house?
	A: The question was is that inconsistent with my	[7]	A: Yes.
[7]	beliefs?	[8]	Q: Which ones?
	Q: Yes.	[9]	A: The York Dispatch and York Daily Record.
[9]	A: Yes.	Ì	Q: Does your wife read them?
[0]	Q: Why is that inconsistent with your beliefs?	[10]	A: I don't know.
1]		[11]	Q: Do you ever discuss those?
2]	MR. GILLEN: Objection, relevance.	[12]	A: Discuss what?
[3]	A: Why is it inconsistent with my beliefs? BY MR. HARVEY:	[13]	
4]	— · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	[14]	Q: The things that are in the newspaper.
5]	Q: Yes.	[15]	A: The obituaries.
6]	A: My faith is founded on the book of Genesis.	[16]	Q: Do you read what's written in there about the
7]	Q: Can you explain further?	[17]	Dover school board?
8]	A: They're different.	[18]	A: I did at first. I don't anymore.
9]	Q: How are they different?	[19]	Q: Have you ever disputed anything that's been
20]	A: Do you want to do this again?	[20]	written in either The York Dispatch or the York
21]	Q: I would like to make sure that the record is		Daily Record and attributed to you or the Dover
22]	clear on this point.	[22]	school board?
23]	A: Again, I'm not a scientist, but it's my	[23]	MR. GILLEN: Objection, relevance.
24]	understanding that in the theory of evolution	[24]	A: Disputed with who?
25]	where it goes back to the beginning of man it's	[25]	BY MR. HARVEY:
	Page 2†		Page 2
[1]	happenstance, it just happened, and that is	[1]	Q: Disputed it with the newspapers like write a
	inconsistent with my faith.	[2]	letter to them or call them up and say you've
[3]	Q: Let's see if we just can agree on who was on the	[3]	got it wrong?
[4]	board on October the 18th just so we're on the	[4]	A: Yes.
[5]	same common frame. We have you, we have	[5]	Q: How many times?
	Ms. Harkins, Ms. Geesey, Mr. Wenrich,	[6]	A: I don't know, several.
(71	Mr. Bonsell, Mr. and Mrs. Brown, Ms. Yingling,	[7]	Q: Did you in writing or by phone?
	and Ms. Cleaver.	[8]	A: I usually talk to the reporter that comes to the
[9]	A. The succeeds wight	[9]	meetings.
10]	A No. 1 Arms was great had a discussion with any of	[10]	S 3377 1- 1- 1- 1- 1- 1- 1- 1- 1- 1- 1- 1- 1-
	those people about their beliefs, their	[11]	A Y Residential
	those people about	1	
11] 101	religious views as they relate to the subject of	[12]	Q: Now, are you aware of any inaccuracies in the
12]	religious views as they relate to the subject of	[12]	
[12] [13]	religious views as they relate to the subject of evolution?	[13]	reporting of the York Daily Record or The York
12] 13] [14]	religious views as they relate to the subject of evolution? MR. GILLEN: Objection, relevance.	[13] [14]	reporting of the York Daily Record or The York Dispatch over the last year as it relates to the
12] 13] [14] [15]	religious views as they relate to the subject of evolution? MR. GILLEN: Objection, relevance. A: The answer is not that I recall.	[13] [14] [15]	reporting of the York Daily Record or The York Dispatch over the last year as it relates to the subject of intelligent design, the board's
12] 13] 14] 15]	religious views as they relate to the subject of evolution? MR. GILLEN: Objection, relevance. A: The answer is not that I recall. BY MR. HARVEY:	[13] [14] [15] [16]	reporting of the York Daily Record or The York Dispatch over the last year as it relates to the subject of intelligent design, the board's resolution, or its deliberations?
12] 13] 14] 15]	religious views as they relate to the subject of evolution? MR. GILLEN: Objection, relevance. A: The answer is not that I recall. BY MR. HARVEY: Q: Have any of them ever shared their religious	[13] [14] [15] [16] [17]	reporting of the York Daily Record or The York Dispatch over the last year as it relates to the subject of intelligent design, the board's resolution, or its deliberations? MR. GILLEN: Objection, relevance. Please
12] 13] 14] 15] [16] [17]	religious views as they relate to the subject of evolution? MR. GILLEN: Objection, relevance. A: The answer is not that I recall. BY MR. HARVEY: Q: Have any of them ever shared their religious views with you as it relates to the subject of	[13] [14] [15] [16] [17] [18]	reporting of the York Daily Record or The York Dispatch over the last year as it relates to the subject of intelligent design, the board's resolution, or its deliberations? MR. GILLEN: Objection, relevance. Please answer.
12] [13] [14] [15] [16] [17] [18]	religious views as they relate to the subject of evolution? MR. GILLEN: Objection, relevance. A: The answer is not that I recall. BY MR. HARVEY: Q: Have any of them ever shared their religious views with you as it relates to the subject of evolution?	[13] [14] [15] [16] [17] [18]	reporting of the York Daily Record or The York Dispatch over the last year as it relates to the subject of intelligent design, the board's resolution, or its deliberations? MR. GILLEN: Objection, relevance. Please answer. A: Could you ask that again.
[12] [13] [14] [15] [16] [18] [19]	religious views as they relate to the subject of evolution? MR. GILLEN: Objection, relevance. A: The answer is not that I recall. BY MR. HARVEY: Q: Have any of them ever shared their religious views with you as it relates to the subject of evolution? A: Not that I recall.	[13] [14] [15] [16] [17] [18] [19]	reporting of the York Daily Record or The York Dispatch over the last year as it relates to the subject of intelligent design, the board's resolution, or its deliberations? MR. GILLEN: Objection, relevance. Please answer. A: Could you ask that again. BY MR. HARVEY:
[12] [13] [14] [15] [16] [17] [18] [19] [20]	religious views as they relate to the subject of evolution? MR. GILLEN: Objection, relevance. A: The answer is not that I recall. BY MR. HARVEY: Q: Have any of them ever shared their religious views with you as it relates to the subject of evolution? A: Not that I recall. Q: Now, I'm sure you're aware that the	[13] [14] [15] [16] [17] [18] [19] [20]	reporting of the York Daily Record or The York Dispatch over the last year as it relates to the subject of intelligent design, the board's resolution, or its deliberations? MR. GILLEN: Objection, relevance. Please answer. A: Could you ask that again. BY MR. HARVEY: Q: Sure. Are you aware sitting here today of any
[12] [13] [14] [15] [16] [17] [18] [19] [20] [21]	religious views as they relate to the subject of evolution? MR. GILLEN: Objection, relevance. A: The answer is not that I recall. BY MR. HARVEY: Q: Have any of them ever shared their religious views with you as it relates to the subject of evolution? A: Not that I recall. Q: Now, I'm sure you're aware that the deliberations of the Dover Area School Board as	[13] [14] [15] [16] [17] [18] [19] [20] [21]	reporting of the York Daily Record or The York Dispatch over the last year as it relates to the subject of intelligent design, the board's resolution, or its deliberations? MR. GILLEN: Objection, relevance. Please answer. A: Could you ask that again. BY MR. HARVEY: Q: Sure. Are you aware sitting here today of any inaccuracies in the reporting of The York
[12] [13] [14] [15] [16] [17] [18] [20] [21] [22] [23]	religious views as they relate to the subject of evolution? MR. GILLEN: Objection, relevance. A: The answer is not that I recall. BY MR. HARVEY: Q: Have any of them ever shared their religious views with you as it relates to the subject of evolution? A: Not that I recall. Q: Now, I'm sure you're aware that the deliberations of the Dover Area School Board as it relates to the subject of intelligent design	[13] [14] [15] [16] [17] [18] [19] [20] [21] [22]	reporting of the York Daily Record or The York Dispatch over the last year as it relates to the subject of intelligent design, the board's resolution, or its deliberations? MR. GILLEN: Objection, relevance. Please answer. A: Could you ask that again. BY MR. HARVEY: Q: Sure. Are you aware sitting here today of any inaccuracies in the reporting of The York Dispatch or the York Daily Record over the past
[12] [13] [14] [15] [16] [17] [18] [19] [20] [21]	religious views as they relate to the subject of evolution? MR. GILLEN: Objection, relevance. A: The answer is not that I recall. BY MR. HARVEY: Q: Have any of them ever shared their religious views with you as it relates to the subject of evolution? A: Not that I recall. Q: Now, I'm sure you're aware that the deliberations of the Dover Area School Board as it relates to the subject of intelligent design	[13] [14] [15] [16] [17] [18] [19] [20] [21] [22] [23]	reporting of the York Daily Record or The York Dispatch over the last year as it relates to the subject of intelligent design, the board's resolution, or its deliberations? MR. GILLEN: Objection, relevance. Please answer. A: Could you ask that again. BY MR. HARVEY: Q: Sure. Are you aware sitting here today of any inaccuracies in the reporting of The York

Kitzmiller, et al. v.

January 3, 2004

Area School District Ct (22688-JEJ Document 86-16 Filed 06/15/05 Page 4 of 4

Page 24

[1] particular?

[2] MR. GILLEN: Objection, foundation.

[3] A: Yes.

[4]

BY MR. HARVEY:

[5] Q: What inaccuracies are you aware of?

A: You're going back over a year. I don't remember everything.

[8] **Q:** Completely understand that you wouldn't remember

[9] everything. Do you remember anything?

[10] A: Yes.

[11] **Q:** Tell me what you remember that was inaccurate.

[12] A: Well, just recently, I think it was last week,

[13] last week Mr. Maldonaldo put in the newspaper

[14] that I was back from my - where I was and

indicated that I wouldn't say where I went

[16] because my attorney told me not to, and that's

[17] not true.

[18] Q: How about other than that, are you aware of any

other— Can you tell me any other inaccuracies

[20] sitting here today that you remember?

[21] MR. GILLEN: Objection, foundation.

[22] A: I know there were various and assorted

[23] statements attributed to me that were let's just

[24] say less than accurate.

BY MR. HARVEY:

Page 25

[1] **Q:** Any that you're aware of right now that you can [2] tell me about?

A: I can just tell you that I know over the course

[4] of the year there were things attributed to me

[5] that weren't accurate. If you have something

[6] for me to see, I'll look at it and tell you.

[7] Q: We're going to get to that in just a second. I

[8] just want to know you can't sitting here right

[9] now think of what those things were?

[10] A: Well, it's been a while. Like I told you, I got

[11] tired of reading it. I don't read what they say

[12] anymore. I check the obituaries. I look at the

[13] sports and that's it. I don't care what people

[14] want to say. It's usually nothing relevant

[15] anyway.

Q: Sitting in front of you is a series of exhibits

[17] that we used this morning, and we're going to

[18] use the same ones this afternoon plus maybe some

[19] more. Right now I've got in front of you

[20] Deposition Exhibit 5 which is a compendium of

[21] articles from The York Dispatch and the York

[22] Daily Record.

MR. GILLEN: Did you say four or five?

[24] MR. HARVEY: I meant four.

BY MR. HARVEY:

Q: I'm not going to ask you to look at this entire

[2] thing because that would take you the rest of

[3] the day, but I am going to ask you to look at

[4] some portions of it.

[5] Now, if you turn to the June the 8th —

[6] it's in chronological order — York Dispatch,

[7] June the 8th, do you see the headline is Dover

[8] Debates Evolution in Biology Text, Book on hold

[9] Because it Doesn't Address Creationism. That's

[10] The York Dispatch June the 8th?

[11] A: Apparently.

[12] Q: Let me ask you, at or about this time, June the

8th, 2004, was the biology textbook for the

[14] ninth grade on hold because it didn't address

[15] creationism?

[16] A: No.

Q: Was it ever on hold because it didn't address

[18] creationism?

[19] A: No.

[20] Q: Was it ever on hold?

[21] **A:** Now we got to play with dates here. At first

[22] the science department wanted a book that was a

2002 model. We later found out there was one

_[24] that came out that was dated 2004. So I don't

[25] know which book we're talking about because we

Page 27

[1] put the 2002 on hold to see if we could get the

[2] 2004.

[3] **Q**: What about in or about June of 2004 of this

[4] year?

[5] A: I don't know what the date was, but.

[6] Q: Do you remember that the school faculty and

7] administration recommended that the book Biology

[8] by Kenneth Miller be purchased?

9] **A:** The 2004 model?

[10] Q: Yes.

[11] A: Yes.

[12] **Q:** Do you remember if that decision was put on hold

[13] for any reason by the board?

[14] A: I know at that time we didn't have a full board.

[15] Somebody was on vacation. And I think the

[16] thought was to put it on hold until that person

[17] came back.

[18] Q: Was that the only reason — only time it was

[19] ever on hold?

[20] A: That was when it was on hold, as I recall.

[21] **Q:** Was it ever put on hold because of the way it [22] addressed evolution?

[23] A: Because of the way— I don't understand the [24] question.

Q: Well, let me— Let's look at this article right

[23]